



AMANDA MONTOYA <akmontoya@g.ucla.edu>

AMPPS - Decision on Manuscript ID AMPPS-20-0033.R1

Advances in Methods and Practices in Psychological Science

<onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com>

Reply-To: ampps.editor@gmail.com

To: akmontoya@ucla.edu

Thu, Sep 3, 2020 at 9:45

AM

03-Sep-2020

Dear Dr. Montoya:

Thank you for submitting the revised version of your manuscript (AMPPS-20-0033.R1) entitled "Census of Journal Policies for Registered Reports: The First Seven Years of Adoption" to Advances in Methods and Practices in Psychological Science (AMPPS). I and the AE who evaluated the original submission and suggested an immediate revision have read the new version and your explanation of changes. Unfortunately, we did not think this approach to the revision worked. Consequently, we have decided not to consider the manuscript further.

In our original evaluation, we raised concerns about the comparison group of journals (among other things). The revised paper addressed those concerns by removing all of the comparisons rather than by strengthening the comparison group so that it would allow for a more informative evaluation. We recognize that improving the comparison group would have been challenging, but those comparisons were a core part of what we felt the manuscript's contribution to be. Similarly, the paper dropped comparisons to open practices at journals with and without RRs rather than developing an appropriate comparison group. Without such control groups for comparison, we felt that what remained in the paper did not make enough of a substantive contribution for AMPPS contribution (i.e., taking it enough beyond the information that's on OSF).

I know that you will be disappointed that our assessment of the revision was not more positive given that you put a lot of work into this project both originally and since the initial submission. I hope the outcome for this submission will not discourage you from submitting future manuscripts to AMPPS.

Sincerely,
Dan

Daniel J. Simons, Editor
Advances in Methods and Practices in Psychological Science (AMPPS)
Psychology Department, University of Illinois
ampps.editor@gmail.com